

April 26, 2019

Phyllis Heverly Flesher  
Chief Financial and Operations Officer  
Conestoga Valley School District  
2110 Horseshoe Road  
Lancaster, PA 17601

Re: Brownstown Elementary School Renovations and Additions  
Recommendations for Bid Award

Dear Phyllis,

The following document is intended to provide recommendations for Bid Award for the Renovations and Additions to Brownstown Elementary School. We recommend that the five apparent low bidders highlighted on the attached Bid Tabs be awarded the prime contracts for the project scope of work based on their base bids submitted.

General Construction –	Lobar, Inc.
Mechanical Construction –	Myco Mechanical, Inc.
Electrical Construction –	McCarty and Son, Inc.
Plumbing Construction –	Jay R. Reynolds, Inc.
Food Service Equipment -	11400, Inc.

Each project alternate is addressed below with corresponding recommendations for approval developed by the Design Team and District Administration. These recommendations are reflected on the summary page of the attached Bid Tabulation Forms.

GC 07A (\$3,200)

Base Bid: Provide metal panels on South wall of the gymnasium.

Deduct Bid: Eliminate metal panels on the South wall elevation of the gymnasium and provide through-wall flashing.

Recommendation: Do not accept deduct alternate. The intent of the metal panels is to correct existing water infiltration at the gymnasium wall. By deleting this scope, modifications to the existing masonry wall flashing are required, resulting in a very low credit. The metal wall panels will provide a better and warranted long term solution to the water infiltration problem.

GC 08A \$29,000

Base Bid: Provide intruder function door hardware.

Add Alternate: Provide “Shelter Locking” system for selected doors.

Recommendation: Do not accept, the added cost was higher than anticipated.

The base bid includes intruder locks that will allow for each classroom to be locked during an emergency. The add alternate adds a fab to the system.

If “Shelter Locking” system is utilized at Brownstown, this will set the precedence moving forward to incorporate it into all other buildings.

EC 08A \$1,000

Base Bid: Provide intruder function door hardware.

Add Alternate: Provide Shelter Locking system for selected doors.

Recommendation: Do not accept. This item is associated with GC 08A.

GC 09A \$85,000

Base Bid: Provide Fine Fissured NRC (0.70) acoustical ceiling tile or equal.

Add Alternate: Install Ultima High NRC (0.80) acoustical ceiling tile.

Recommendation: Do not accept, due to high price increase for additional noise reduction. The NRC 0.70 tile is a higher performing tile than the District’s standard tile which is NRC 0.55.

GC 10A (\$6,600)

Base Bid: Provide Operable partitions with an STC rating of 56, 4” thick.

Deduct Alternate: Provide Operable partitions with an STC rating of 52, 3” thick.

Recommendation: Do not accept. The cost savings are minimal to reduce the noise transmission (STC rating) between classrooms.

GC 10B (\$5,000)

Base Bid: Remove, store and re-install the mosaic mural located at the existing cafeteria wall.

Deduct Alternate: Provide cost savings to remove and dispose of the mosaic mural located at the existing cafeteria wall.

Recommendation: Do not accept, cost savings is minimal for scope of work. During construction, if the mosaic is not salvageable we can negotiate a price with the General Contractor for a deduct change order to eliminate this scope.

GC 11A \$2,100

Base Bid: Provide individual key control of gymnasium of equipment.

Add Alternate Bid: Provide cost to provide a keypad group controller for gymnasium equipment.

Recommendation: Accept cost for keypad controller, this minimal cost will simplify the operation of the gymnasium equipment.

EC 11A NO CHANGE

Base Bid: Provide individual key control of gymnasium of equipment.

Add Alternate Bid: Provide cost to provide a keypad group controller for gymnasium equipment.

Recommendation: Accept cost for keypad controller, this item is tied to GC 11A above.

PC 22A (\$7,000)

Base Bid: Provide copper above grade water piping.  
Deduct Alternate: Provide Pex above grade water piping.

Recommendation: Do not accept, the minimal credit to remove copper piping is lower than expected and copper is a tried and true material.

#### MC 23A

Base Bid: Provide ATC Controls by Dynatech Distech Controls Eclipse Connected BACnet IP

MC 23Ab Add Alternate: Add cost to provide ATC Controls by Tri-M.  
Add \$120,000

Recommendation: Do not accept, additional cost to provide ATC controls by Tri-M is not recommended due to favorable pricing from Trane.

MC 23Ac Deduct Alternate: Deduct cost to provide ATC Controls by Trane.  
Deduct (\$4,000)

Recommendation: Accept deduct cost, Trane ATC Controls provides a cost savings and will interface with existing building controls in the District (District has high percentage of Trane in other buildings).

MC 23Ad Add Alternate: Add cost to provide ATC Controls by Johnson Controls  
Add \$200,000

Recommendation: Do not accept, additional cost to provide ATC controls by Johnson Controls is not recommended due to favorable pricing from Trane.

#### MC 23B \$200,000

Base Bid: Provide Sentinel Model unit ventilators manufactured by Airedale.  
Add Alternate: Provide added cost to provide Freshman Model unit ventilators manufactured by Change-Air.

Recommendation: Do not accept, the base bid unit ventilators will provide comparable performance.

#### EC 26A NO CHANGE

Base Bid: Provide lighting control system by Wattstopper.  
Add or Deduct Alternate: Provide distributed digital lighting control system by Lutron – Quantum.

#### EC 26B NO CHANGE

Base Bid: Provide lighting control system by Wattstopper.  
Add or Deduct Alternate: Provide network lighting controls and digital lighting control system as manufactured by Encelium.

Recommendation for EC 26A and 26B: Accept preferred system lighting control system by Wattstopper.

GC 26C \$3,000

Base Bid: Provide pendant lighting as shown on the base bid lighting drawings.

Alternate Bid: Provide 2x2 LED lighting as shown on the alternate bid lighting drawings.

Recommendation: Accept the additional cost to go to 2x2 lighting. The additional cost is minimal in correlation with the savings provided by the Electrical Contractor. The additional cost by the General Contractor is to provide additional labor and material associated with grid required to support the 2x2 light panels.

EC 26C (\$93,400)

Base Bid: Provide pendant lighting as shown on the base bid lighting drawings.

Alternate Bid: Provide 2x2 LED lighting as shown on the alternate bid lighting drawings.

Recommendation: Accept the cost savings to provide 2x2 lighting in lieu of pendant lighting due to the favorable pricing with this item.

EC 27A \$34,800

Base Bid: Provide category 6E cabling, connectors and equipment.

Add Alternate: Provide category 6A cabling, connectors and equipment.

Recommendation: Do not accept. The CVSD IT Department does not feel the additional cost is worth the upgrade to category 6A data.

EC 28A \$12,000

Base Bid: Provide access controls system by MAXxess Systems.

Add Alternate: Provide access controls system by DNA Fusion.

Recommendation: Do not accept, additional cost is not warranted to provide access controls by DNA Fusion. The MAXxess Systems controls will meet the project requirements.

EC 28B NO BID

Base Bid: Provide access controls system by MAXxess Systems.

Add Alternate: Provide access controls system by Colbalt X1.

Recommendation: Accept base bid MAXxess system.

GC 32A \$180,000

Base Bid: No alterations to the existing playground surfacing.

Add Alternate: Provide added cost to provide and install the specified poured-in-place playground surfacing or approved equal.

Recommendation: Do not accept, the additional cost was higher than expected for the poured-in-place playground surfacing. This item can also be undertaken at a future time as an independent project.

Respectfully Submitted,  
MAROTTA / MAIN Architects

Donald Main, RA, AIA, Principal  
Matthew Griffith, Project Manager

Attachments: 18 April, 2019 Bid Tabulation Forms